Merger Feasibility Study Final Report

Clymer and Panama Central School Districts
PROCESS

Clymer COMMUNITY

JOINT BOARDS OF EDUCATION

FEASIBILITY STUDY COMMITTEE (22)

FOCUS GROUPS (21)

INTERVIEWS OF STAFF

Panama COMMUNITY
Feasibility Study Committee Process

- 5 meetings
- Public invited to attend all meetings
- Tours of each building prior to meetings #2 and #3
- Presentation of data
- Questions for Committee Members
- Notes from each meeting sent to committee members
- Meeting notes posted on districts’ websites
# Feasibility Study Committee Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clymer</th>
<th>Panama</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Carrie Shampoe</td>
<td>John Owens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Babcock</td>
<td>Jeffrey Ireland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bethany Collins</td>
<td>John Brown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julie White</td>
<td>Audra Smith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Shifler</td>
<td>Thomas Golden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandi Johnson</td>
<td>Carolina Delahoy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Linton</td>
<td>Steve Carlson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melanie Battaglia</td>
<td>Tim Card</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Honey</td>
<td>Kathryn Curtis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brody Howard</td>
<td>Cliff Jones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dave Calvert</td>
<td>Wayne Smith</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Focus Group Meetings

• 22 meetings scheduled; 21 held - students, staff, parents, community members, senior citizens, agri-business leaders, volunteer organizations, Amish leaders

• 284 people attended to provide perceptions and learn about the current status of each district

• Perception data resulted
Staff Interviews – 25T.

1 Superintendent – Bert Lictus (2x)
2 Business Officials – Luann Laurito-Baghat, Amanda Kolstee
1 Director of Technology – Brynne Hinsdale
1 Director of Curriculum and Instruction – Emily Harvey (2x)
3 Principals - Ed Bailey, Sonia DuBois, Fran Frey
2 Athletic Directors – Scott Neckers, Chris Payne
2 Mechanics - Brent Rhebergen, Steve Carlson (Transportation)
1 Transportation Clerk - Jerry Irleand
1 Superintendent of Building and Grounds – Mark Peters
1 Head Mechanic – John Roth
1 Cook Manager/Head Chef – Sue Waltrous
1 Personal Touch Consortium Manager – Sandy Paden (Cafeteria)
2 Teacher Association Presidents – Lynne Bemis, Loren Smith
1 Teacher Association V.P. – Mark Powers
2 Support Staff Association Presidents - Andrea Dunnewold, Donna Vistrand
1 Support Staff Association Past President – Gina Newton
## Population

### US Census 2000 & 2010 Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clymer CSD</th>
<th>Census 2000</th>
<th>Census 2010</th>
<th>Changes</th>
<th>Change %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Population</td>
<td>3103</td>
<td>3208</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 0-17</td>
<td>915</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Panama CSD</th>
<th>Census 2000</th>
<th>Census 2010</th>
<th>Changes</th>
<th>Changes %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Population</td>
<td>3699</td>
<td>3502</td>
<td>-197</td>
<td>-5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 0-17</td>
<td>1058</td>
<td>824</td>
<td>-234</td>
<td>-22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[www.statisticalatlas.com\school-districts\new-york](http://www.statisticalatlas.com\school-districts\new-york)
Household Demographics

# of Households
Clymer: 2,940  Panama: 3,473

Family Households w/Children < 18
Clymer: 852 (29%)  Panama: 993 (28.6%)

Median Household Income
Clymer: $45,300  Panama: $45,000
## Educational Attainment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree Status</th>
<th>Clymer</th>
<th>Panama</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education Degree</td>
<td>27.2%</td>
<td>39.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School Diploma</td>
<td>53.9%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No H.S. Diploma</td>
<td>18.9%</td>
<td>10.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Student Enrollment

• Enrollment data obtained from districts

• Enrollments projected ten years into the future

• Live births from NYS Health Department averaged to make projected enrollments

• Cohort comparison model used
Student Enrollment

• Survival ratios for each grade level calculated

• A cohort survival ratio obtained

• Five years of enrollment history is used to develop four years of survival ratios

• The average of these four ratios for each grade level was used to project that grade’s enrollment forward
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Clymer</th>
<th>Panama</th>
<th>Combined</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16-17</td>
<td>449</td>
<td>476</td>
<td>925</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17-18</td>
<td>444(-5)</td>
<td>463(-13)</td>
<td>907(-18)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-19</td>
<td>441(-4)</td>
<td>472(+9)</td>
<td>913(+6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-20</td>
<td>441(0)</td>
<td>462(-10)</td>
<td>903(-10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-21</td>
<td>449(+8)</td>
<td>461(-1)</td>
<td>910(+7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-22</td>
<td>445(-4)</td>
<td>468(+7)</td>
<td>913(+3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22-23</td>
<td>454(+9)</td>
<td>471(+3)</td>
<td>925(+12)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Curriculum and Instruction

• Programming must be sufficient for students to succeed in the 21st century

• Level of rigor and learning demands continue to increase

• More similarities than differences in the two school districts
Curriculum and Instruction Data Reviewed

• **Grade Configurations, School Schedules, Class Sizes**

• **Programs and Texts:** K—12 courses of study; K–6 textbooks; class sizes and course enrollments; college credits; alternative education enrollments; BOCES Career and Technical Education placements

• **Student Achievement Data:** NYS math and ELA assessment proficiency rates; Regents passing and mastery scores; attendance rates; disciplinary actions
Curriculum and Instruction Data Reviewed

- **Graduation Data:** rates, types of diplomas awarded, graduate plans, post-graduation outcomes; dropouts

- **Special Education and Student Placement Data:** Classification rates by disability; special education placements; BOCES special education placements; 504 classification numbers; out-of-district placements; home instruction numbers

- **Extra Curricular Activities and Athletics:** Offerings and participation

- **Technology:** equipment, platforms, networks
Curriculum and Instruction
Findings

• School schedules are almost identical
• Elementary textbooks are almost identical
• Differences in special education classification rates and processes exist
• Achievement levels differ at the elementary level, and each secondary school has different strengths
• Both districts offer JCC classes but no Advanced Placement courses
• Student athletics are already merged in 8 team sports
• Increased number of extra-curricular activities possible if merged
Curriculum and Instruction
Conclusions

• **Increased enrollment needed** to ensure availability and stability of electives and advanced programming needed for 21st Century students

• Each district offers **unique programs** that could be available to more students if districts merged

• A shared Director of Curriculum and Instruction has allowed common curriculum planning and shared professional development
Curriculum and Instruction

Conclusions

Merger would increase educational opportunities and programs for students in both districts

- Honors and advanced learning
- Music, art, electives
- Technology and CTE programs
- Athletics, extra-curricular activities

while increasing staff efficiencies at all levels
Curriculum and Instruction

Conclusions

Merging teaching staffs could

– Bring out the best in both
– Provide a larger pool of talent to make the needed changes in curriculum and instruction
– Improve data driven instruction
– Use economies of scale to provide for programs that do not exist, such as honors classes and AP classes
Fiscal Condition of the Districts

• 2 major factors impacting the need for a study:
  – Limited ability to increase taxes
  – Reduction in state aid for last several years (Foundation Aid)
  – Limited increases in new state aid (Foundation Aid)
  – Contractual obligations spiraling higher

• Comments from the public:
  – “No tax increases.”
  – “We won’t pay Panama’s penalty.”
Local Support for Schools

• Both districts’ residents have supported their local schools by passing their budgets and capital projects, and their transportation initiatives for the past 10 years.
## Budget Projections

*Panama Penalty Eliminated by NYSED*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2019 Merged</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clymer</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Approved Budget</td>
<td>Projection</td>
<td>Projection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenues</td>
<td>$9,506,945</td>
<td>$10,450,597</td>
<td>$10,448,137</td>
<td>$24,615,620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditures</td>
<td>$10,318,081</td>
<td>$11,287,390</td>
<td>$11,775,145</td>
<td>$26,114,195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+/-</td>
<td>-$811,136</td>
<td>-$836,793</td>
<td>-$1,327,008</td>
<td>-1,498,575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Approved Budget</td>
<td>Projection</td>
<td>Fund Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenues</td>
<td>$13,390,800</td>
<td>$13,137,146</td>
<td>$13,285,645</td>
<td>$3,394,358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditures</td>
<td>$12,741,856</td>
<td>$13,739,877</td>
<td>$14,333,566</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+/-</td>
<td>+$648,944</td>
<td>-$602,731</td>
<td>-$1,047,919</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>2019 Merged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clymer</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Approved Budget</td>
<td>Projection</td>
<td>Projection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>2019 Merged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenues</td>
<td>$9,506,945</td>
<td>$10,450,597</td>
<td>$10,448,137</td>
<td>$24,615,620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditures</td>
<td>$10,318,081</td>
<td>$11,287,390</td>
<td>$11,775,145</td>
<td>26,114,196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+/-</td>
<td>-$811,136</td>
<td>-$836,793</td>
<td>-$1,327,008</td>
<td>(1,498,575)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Approved Budget</td>
<td>Projection</td>
<td>Fund Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>$475,947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revenues</td>
<td>$13,390,800</td>
<td>$10,218,735</td>
<td>$13,285,645</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditures</td>
<td>$12,741,856</td>
<td>$13,739,877</td>
<td>$14,333,566</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+/-</td>
<td>+$648,944</td>
<td>(3,521,142)</td>
<td>(1,047,919)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Fund Balance Past and Future

**Assuming NO Changes in Expenditures**

**YEAR END CUMULATIVE FUND BALANCE (State Aid Growth 1.4%)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Clymer</th>
<th>Panama</th>
<th>Merged</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>2,321,749</td>
<td>3,968,875</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>2,506,793</td>
<td>3,712,582</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>2,410,430</td>
<td>3,246,965</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>2,929,942</td>
<td>3,564,707</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>2,118,806</td>
<td>4,213,651</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>1,282,013</td>
<td>692,509</td>
<td>484,463</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>(41,786)</td>
<td>(350,104)</td>
<td>(1,878,485)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>(1,750,216)</td>
<td>(1,877,489)</td>
<td>(4,958,153)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2021</td>
<td>(3,865,208)</td>
<td>(3,904,564)</td>
<td>(8,834,423)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2022</td>
<td>(6,233,421)</td>
<td>(6,477,058)</td>
<td>(14,223,35)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2023</td>
<td>(9,059,623)</td>
<td>(9,650,969)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Clymer, Panama, and the merged fund are shown for comparison purposes.*
Revenues and Expenditures

State Aid per Enrolled Child

Panama penalty eliminated

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>2017 Actual</th>
<th>2018 Budget</th>
<th>2019 Estimated</th>
<th>% of Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clymer</td>
<td>$22,980</td>
<td>$25,422</td>
<td>$26,641</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>$26,769</td>
<td>$29,676</td>
<td>$30,368</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Projected True Tax Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Clymer True Tax Rate</th>
<th>Panama True Tax Rate</th>
<th>Merged District True Tax Rate</th>
<th>Incentive Aid Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>$13.55</td>
<td>$18.24</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>$13.80</td>
<td>$18.02</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>$13.69</td>
<td>$18.13</td>
<td>$13.65</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>$14.13</td>
<td>$18.24</td>
<td>$13.99</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2021</td>
<td>$14.29</td>
<td>$18.35</td>
<td>$14.52</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2022</td>
<td>$14.46</td>
<td>$18.45</td>
<td>$14.69</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Clymer State Aid Adjusted by GEA 2011-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clymer</th>
<th>Gap Elimination Aid (GEA)</th>
<th>Total State Aid</th>
<th>% Change Total Aid</th>
<th>5-Year Avg.</th>
<th>5-Year Average without GEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td></td>
<td>5,953,011</td>
<td>3.92%</td>
<td>4.03%</td>
<td>1.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td></td>
<td>5,728,497</td>
<td>0.91%</td>
<td>3.18%</td>
<td>0.52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>-6,411</td>
<td>5,676,745</td>
<td>2.06%</td>
<td>0.75%</td>
<td>-1.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>-124,693</td>
<td>5,562,066</td>
<td>5.33%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>-309,042</td>
<td>5,280,535</td>
<td>6.60%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>-552,386</td>
<td>4,953,662</td>
<td>0.23%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>-658,407</td>
<td>4,942,158</td>
<td>-9.69%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>-488,205</td>
<td>5,472,269</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Panama State Aid Adjusted by GEA 2011-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gap Elimination Aid (GEA)</th>
<th>Total State Aid</th>
<th>% Change Total Aid</th>
<th>5-Year Avg</th>
<th>5-Year Avg without GEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td></td>
<td>9,356,349</td>
<td>1.46%</td>
<td>4.22%</td>
<td>1.43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td></td>
<td>9,221,494</td>
<td>6.10%</td>
<td>4.43%</td>
<td>1.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>-207,073</td>
<td>8,691,022</td>
<td>5.80%</td>
<td>0.56%</td>
<td>-1.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>-597,419</td>
<td>8,214,327</td>
<td>4.14%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>-776,024</td>
<td>7,887,516</td>
<td>2.09%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>-1,078,547</td>
<td>7,725,675</td>
<td>2.35%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>-1,272,118</td>
<td>7,547,961</td>
<td>10.70%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>-911,308</td>
<td>8,452,800</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NYS Incentive Aid for the Merged District

- Incentive Operating Aid: $16.4M over 14 years
  Over first 5 years - 40% of 16.4M ($1,732,116 per year)
  Amount decreases by 4% per year for next 9 years

NYS recommends using this aid to reduce taxes, improve programming, and create capital reserves (savings)

- Capital Building Incentive Aid: available for first 10 years at 95% of expenses
Student Transportation

• Both districts transport their own students

• Both districts run a single run (K-12)

• Clymer is 82.49 sq. miles

• Panama is 60 sq. miles

• New district would be 140.49 sq. miles
Student Transportation

New district would be the largest in the county by 2.63 miles

- Cassadaga Valley - 137.86 sq. miles
- Chautauqua Lake - 103.58 sq. miles
- Sherman - 103.25 sq. miles
Student Transportation

Clymer

Number of Bus Runs
8 buses in the AM  8 buses in the PM
Longest time on bus - 70 min.
Average time on bus – 29 min.

Panama

Number of Bus Runs
11 buses in the AM  11 buses in the PM
Longest time on bus - 55 min.
Average time on bus – 27 min.
Technology

Similarities
Network Operating system, Email system, Student Information System, BOCES funding and services, AV repair, Staffing

Differences
Phone systems, Security cameras

• Both districts have PC’s and Macs.
• Both districts are moving toward every student having their own I-pad.
• Both districts offer limited DL classes.
• Both districts are moving in the same direction through sharing and similar philosophies.
Food Service

Clymer

Free lunch – 213     Reduced - 23
Avg. daily participation – 277 (56%)
Lunch costs: K-8=$1.90     9-12=$2.00
Operating deficit - $2,203

Panama

Free lunch – 193     Reduced – 14
Avg. daily participation – 160 (34%)
Lunch costs: K-5=$2.15     6-12=$2.30
Operating profit - $641
Data Reviewed: Facilities

- Building tours, noting general conditions of facilities
- Architectural drawings of current and prior renovations
- 5 year facilities plans and projected plans
- State aid incentives and building aid ratios, present and for new district
- Athletic/physical education facilities – indoor and outdoor
- Art and music facilities
Facilities - Clymer

Size of Property: 28.71 acres

Building:

- Addition: 1949 - 18,270 sq. ft. - classrooms
- Addition 1960 - 17,400 sq. ft. – classrooms and gym
- Addition 1969 - 13,620 sq. ft. - classrooms
- Addition 2000 - 5,000 sq. ft. - maintenance/boiler house
- Addition 2003 - 45,996 sq. ft. – classrooms, gym with stage; septic system

Total square footage: 128,836 square feet
Facilities - Clymer

Bus Garage Area: 10,000 sq. ft.

- Built in 1949 - 6,600 sq. ft.
- Addition in 2003 - 3,400 sq. ft.

Facilities - Panama

Size of Property: 67 acres total, with 43 usable acreages.

Building:

Original Building 1953
- Basement 13,523 sq. ft.
- 1st Floor 27,768 sq. ft.
- 2nd Floor 27,768 sq. ft.

Addition 1968
- 1st Floor 27,318 sq. ft.
- 2nd Floor 21,462 sq. ft.

Addition 1989
- Basement 10,075 sq. ft.
- 1st Floor 9,794 sq. ft.
- 2nd Floor 9,794 sq. ft.

Addition 2001
- 2nd Floor 23,328 sq. ft.

Bus Garage 15,445 sq. ft.

Addition 2010
- 1st Floor 16,419 sq. ft.

Total Square Footage of each floor:

- Basement Floor 23,598 sq. ft.
- 1st Floor 115,783 sq. ft.
- 2nd Floor 88,918 sq. ft.

Total Square Footage of Building: 228,299 sq. ft.

Facilities - Panama

Total Square Footage of each floor:

- Basement Floor: 23,598 sq. ft.
- 1st Floor: 115,783 sq. ft.
- 2nd Floor: 88,918 sq. ft.

Total Square Footage of Building: 228,299 sq. ft.

Building Aid Ratios

• Clymer – 83.8%

• Panama – 85.6%

• New district – 95%
## Operation/Maintenance Costs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Clymer</th>
<th>Panama</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operation of Plant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contracts/others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials and supplies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOCES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Instructional Staff</td>
<td>$358,782</td>
<td>$399,546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material and supplies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operation and Maintenance Sub</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$730,793</td>
<td>$876,086</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Comparison of Facilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Clymer</th>
<th>Panama</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Sq. Ft.</td>
<td>128,836</td>
<td>228,299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost per Sq. Ft.</td>
<td>$5.67</td>
<td>$3.84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Classrooms in the Proposed Merged District

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classrooms for Core Instruction</th>
<th>Total Student Population</th>
<th>No. of classrooms required</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>K-6 Average 16 per Classroom</td>
<td>487</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-12 Average 18 per classroom</td>
<td>438</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Classrooms needed</td>
<td>925</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Possible Future Uses of Existing Buildings

• Community Center
• Office space for government agencies or professionals, including the public library
• Private school use: elementary, secondary or higher education (Amish, JCC, Edinboro College)
• Medical facilities or offices
• Agricultural resources center
• Adult living spaces
Contracts

Panama and Clymer Teachers’ contracts end on June 30, 2019 and June 30, 2018, respectively

The teachers’ contracts are generally similar in structure and major provisions as follows:
Teachers’ Contracts

Highlights from each district’s teacher contract

- In 2017-18, Clymer Step 1 teacher starts at $4,000 less than Panama’s at the Bachelor level, and $4,625 less at the Master’s level.

- Clymer pays $10 dollars more per graduate credit hour. For example, Clymer pays $2,100 for 30 graduate hours, compared to Panama’s $1,800 for 30 graduate hours. The graduate hours pay is added to the teacher’s base salary that year.

- Clymer has a longevity step at year 20 and year 25. The Bachelor schedule shows an increase at step 20 of $9,000 and at step 25 of $5,000.

- Panama has a salary schedule to step 25.

Clymer and Panama steps between 20 and 25:

- Clymer step 20 is at $80,000, Panama step 20 is at $76,943
- Clymer Step 25 is at $85,000, Panama step 25 is at $90,000
The Clymer and Panama top steps in comparison to those in Chautauqua County and Erie County are shown below.

- Average top step at Erie 2 Chautauqua Cattaraugus BOCES is $85,068
- Average top step in Chautauqua County is $83,571
- Average top step in Erie County is $89,087

This information was obtained from the Labor Relations Office at E2CC BOCES
Retirees’ Health Benefits

Retiree’s Health cost paid by district:

Clymer – 2016-17 -$259,278- 46 retirees
2017-18 -$289,107- 46 retirees

Panama – 2016-17 -$77,919- 10 retirees
2017-18 -$112,175-6 retirees and 4
possible plus $35,000 one time deposit.
Superintendent’s Contract

Contract ended in June 2017 and was renewed

A new district must pay off remaining years of a superintendent’s contract if that person is not hired for the merged district.
Business Officials’ and Principals’ Contracts

• Contract provisions are similar
• Benefits and salaries are similar in both districts.
• Currently only one full time business official.
• 2016-17 year Panama had one principal K-12
# Bargaining Units

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Clymer</strong></th>
<th><strong>Panama</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teachers</strong></td>
<td>Clymer Ed. Association NYSUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instructional Support</strong></td>
<td>Clymer Ed. Support Personnel NYSUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teacher Assistants</strong></td>
<td>Included in Clymer Ed. Support Personnel-NYSUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teacher Aides/Clerks/Cafeteria/Food/Bus Drivers/Custodial</strong></td>
<td>Included in Clymer Ed. Support Personnel-NYSUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>School Nurse</strong></td>
<td>Clymer Ed. Association NYSUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Secretarial/Account Clerks/</strong></td>
<td>Individual Contracts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Business Official/Directors/Principal</strong></td>
<td>Individual Contracts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Proposed Merged Staffing

• Staff reductions are inevitable with or without a merger.

• Recommended class size limits – NO MORE THAN:
  – K-1: 16 - 18 students
  – 2-5: 16 - 20 students
  – 6-12: 20 students and no LESS than 6-8 students (electives)
Proposed Merged Staffing

• Current Teaching Staff Levels:
  – Clymer – 50.4 positions (ALL staff)
  – Panama – 55.1 positions (ALL staff)
  – **Merged – 91.5 positions**

Current Support Staff Levels:
- Clymer – 46 positions (ALL staff)
– Panama – 47 positions (ALL staff)
– **Merged – 93 positions**
Proposed Merged Administrative Staffing

• Administrators-
  – Clymer – 6.7 FTE
  – Panama – 7.5 FTE
  – Merged – 10 FTE

  – Estimated savings: $1,346,800
## How Much to Level Up?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clymer Salary</td>
<td>Panama Salary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule</td>
<td>Schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$1,474,100</td>
<td>$1,509,183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Money</td>
<td>New Money</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>needed to level</td>
<td>needed to level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>up to Panama</td>
<td>up to Clymer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$111,364</td>
<td>$31,447</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total: $142,811**
The Essential Question

Will...

Creating a new school district via the merger process in NYS provide

• enhanced or maintained educational opportunities,

and at the same time

• increase long term efficiencies and lower costs for the taxpayers of both Clymer CSD and Panama CSD?
Recommendations

1. Merge to create a new district with three conditions to meet:
   1. That the new board use 51% of incentive aid for two years to level taxes, and then 40%
   2. That the Panama penalty be paid prior to the date that the new district begins operations
   3. That the newly merged district attempts within 5 years to merge with another contiguous district
2. Strong effort by district leaders to create a community of trust, respect and understanding between the two communities. Reassure that community traditions can continue and be strengthened by a larger community.
Recommendations

3. Monitor enrollment figures from year to year.

4. New board of education establish a policy providing guidance on the number of students to be enrolled in a secondary course.

5. Review of all secondary courses by the Director of C&I and one representative from each school for each subject area.
Recommendations

6. Keep both bus garages open, with a mechanic in each one. Hire one transportation supervisor for the new district.

7. Create transportation policies for safe and efficient transportation, with no child on a bus for more than 60 minutes.
Recommendations

8. If no merger, purchase transportation routing software and share a transportation supervisor.

9. In a new district, have an in-house food service program with meal prices to cover program cost.
Recommendations

10. Other positions:
0.5 Athletic Director
1.0 School Psychologist
2.0 Guidance Counselors (1)
1.0 Social Worker at elementary level (+1)
1.0 Transportation Director (-1)
1.0 Cafeteria Manager (-1)
1.0 Head of Buildings and Grounds (-1)
Recommendations

10. 1 Superintendent
    1 Director of Curriculum & Instruc.
    1 Director of Technology
    2 Principals (-2)
    1 Asst. Principal/CSE Chair (+1)
    1 Business Official (-1)
11. New superintendent’s priority to review staffing levels in clerical, custodial, mechanics, buildings and grounds, food service, transportation. All can be gradually decreased.

- Reduce
  - District Treasurer by 1
  - District Clerk by 1
  - Superintendent’s Secretary by 1
Recommendations

12. Expand use of BOCES services to generate BOCES aid, and continue to share services with other districts. Use BOCES Central Business Office (CBO)
13. Begin collective bargaining as soon as the new district is formed.
14. Level up teachers’ salaries.
Recommendations

15. New board of education to offer a one-time retirement incentive to those eligible.

16. Strongly consider eliminating paying yearly for post-graduate hours earned to the Masters level, since degree is now required for permanent certification.
Recommendations

17. Negotiate contracts to include an 8 period day in secondary school. Attempt to align schedule with other districts to allow more distance learning opportunities.

18. Move forward with the technology plan in place now.

19. Update and install new security system where needed.
20. New board of education to create policies dealing with the monitoring of security systems in the new district.

Assign staff in the administrative offices to monitor the system.
Recommendations

21. Allocate incentive aid as follows:
   51% to reduce taxes in years 1 and 2; 40% in year 3
   30% to improve student programs and address contract costs in yrs. 1&2; 40% in year 3
   19% to reserve funds in years 1 and 2; 20% in year 3
Recommendations

22. Create a capital reserve fund for the operating incentive aid to cover the local share of capital projects (5%) and savings for future needs.

23. Assess building needs of current buildings thoroughly and deliberately to address health and safety needs.
Recommendations

24. Have a nine-member board of education, with representation from various towns and villages if possible.

25. Recommended building use for phase 1 of merger to be followed by a financially sound future plan for housing students: (next slide)
26. Phase 1:
   Clymer building houses Pre-K-5 and 9-12
   Panama building houses Pre-K-5 and 6 – 8
Phase 2:
- New Board of Education determines a single building to house K-12, using an existing building
- or a new site
- If there is another merger in the next few years, a new site would be an option
Recommendation

27. If there is no merger, consider tuitioning secondary students to a neighboring district.
Questions from Members of the Boards of Education